

Robert A. Sacks (SBN 150146)  
sacksr@sullcrom.com  
Rory P. Culver (SBN 271868)  
culverr@sullcrom.com  
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP  
1888 Century Park East, Suite 2100  
Los Angeles, California 90067  
Tel.: (310) 712-6600  
Fax: (310) 712-8800

Laura Kabler Oswell (SBN 241281)  
oswelll@sullcrom.com  
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP  
1870 Embarcadero Road  
Palo Alto, California 94303  
Tel.: (650) 461-5600  
Fax: (650) 461-5700

Attorneys for Intervenor Thomson  
Consumer Electronics, Inc. and  
Thomson S.A. (Specially Appearing)

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Case No. 07-5944-SC

MDL No. 1917

This Document Relates to:

*Electrograph Systems, Inc., et al. v. Hitachi,  
Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-01656;

*Alfred H. Siegel, as Trustee of the Circuit  
City Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust v. Hitachi,  
Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-05502;

*Best Buy Co., Inc., et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et  
al.*, No. 11-cv-05513;

*Target Corp, et al. v. Chunghwa Picture  
Tubes, Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-05514;

*Office Depot, Inc. v. Hitachi Ltd., et al.*, No.  
11-cv-06276;

**[PROPOSED] REPORT AND  
RECOMMENDATION DENYING DIRECT  
ACTION PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR  
LEAVE TO FILE AMENDED  
COMPLAINTS**

Date: May 1, 2013

Time: 9:30 a.m.

JAMS: Two Embarcadero Center, Suite 1500

Judge: Hon. Samuel Conti

Special Master: Hon. Charles A. Legge (Ret.)

**[OPPOSITION; AND DECLARATION OF  
LAURA KABLER OSWELL FILED  
CONCURRENTLY HEREWITH]**

1 *CompuCom Systems, Inc. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et* )  
2 *al., No. 11-cv-06396;* )  
3 *Costco Wholesale Corporation v. Hitachi,* )  
4 *Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-06397;* )  
5 *P.C. Richard & Son Long Island* )  
6 *Corporation, et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No.* )  
7 *12-cv-02648; and* )  
8 )  
9 )  
10 )  
11 )  
12 )  
13 )  
14 )  
15 )  
16 )  
17 )  
18 )  
19 )  
20 )  
21 )  
22 )  
23 )  
24 )  
25 )  
26 )  
27 )  
28 )

To the Honorable Samuel Conti, United States District Judge:

On March 26, 2013, Plaintiffs filed their Motion for Leave to File Amended Complaints (Dkt. No. 1609) (the "Motion to Amend"). In the Motion to Amend, Plaintiffs seek to add Thomson Consumer Electronics, Inc. and Thomson S.A. (collectively, "Thomson") as defendants in this action. On April 9, 2013, Thomson Consumer Electronics, Inc. moved to intervene and, with Thomson S.A., specially appearing, filed Thompson's Opposition to the Motion to Amend.

Having carefully considered the briefs and other submissions of the parties, as well as oral arguments by counsel at the hearing, the Special Master recommends that the Motion to Amend should be DENIED as to Thomson.

DATED: \_\_\_\_\_

Hon. Charles A. Legge  
United States District Judge (Ret.)  
Special Master

The Report and Recommendations are Accepted and Ordered / Denied / Modified.

DATED: \_\_\_\_\_

Hon. Samuel Conti  
United States District Judge